

**Subject: Minutes of Meeting of Empowered Technical Evaluation Committee (ETEC) for evaluating Technical Bids for Consultancy Services for Authority's Engineer for Supervision of "Construction of (i) 2 laning of existing Hunli-Anini road on EPC basis from design km 21.50 to km 37.50 (ii) 2 laning of existing Hunli-Anini road on EPC basis from design km 37.50 to km 53.50 and (iii) 2 laning of existing Hunli-Anini road on EPC basis from design km 53.50 to km 92.500 in the state of Arunachal Pradesh under SARDP-NE." held at NHIDCL, New Delhi on 30.09.2019 (4<sup>th</sup> Meeting).**

1. Consequent upon Approval of Competent Authority, the revised technical score of the bidders along with ETEC 3<sup>rd</sup> minutes of meeting were uploaded on the website for opening of financial bids of the following bidders on 20.09.2019 (1100 hrs).

Sr. No	Firm Name	Technical Score	Status
1	M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s SRIINFOTECH	87.73	Eligible
2	M/s Planning & Infrastructural Development Consultants Pvt Ltd in association with M/s Agnitio infrastructure Projects Pvt Ltd – M/s G Eng. Advisory Services Private Limited (JV)	89.53	Eligible
3	M/s Almondz Global Infra Consultant Ltd- M/s Manglam Associates (JV)	85.41	Eligible

2. A verbal complaint received from one of the bidder i.e. M/s Almondz Global Infra Consultant Ltd- M/s Manglam Associates (JV) to GM (T) regarding review of CV of Team leader of M/s Planning & Infrastructural Development Consultants Pvt Ltd in association with M/s Agnitio infrastructure Projects Pvt Ltd - M/s G Eng. Advisory Services Private Limited (JV). Issue was discussed with Director (Tech) & ED-V(Tech) on 20.09.2019. Director (Tech) has directed that the CV of key personnel of eligible firms need to be reviewed before the opening of financial bids.

3. In the mean time, another complaint was also received through mail from M/s OM Infra Project on 26.09.2019 regarding the qualification of M/s Manglam Associates & Almondz Global Infra Consultant Ltd and some of the key personnel of Feedback Infra & Almondz Global Infra Consultant Ltd.

4. As per Direction of Director (Tech), ETEC committee has examined the all CVs of key personnel of eligible firms along with complaint. ETEC committee observed that some of the CVs of key personnel have experience in O&M and Construction Supervision in same duration leading to ambiguity that which project to be considered. Further some of key personnel have shown two projects in same duration. Committee has also observed that North East Region projects which yet to be under taken on 2 lane was also claimed by key personnel in their CV. Hence ETEC committee re-evaluated all the CVs of key personnel based on the above and detail reasons for not considering the projects is tabulated below:

a) M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s SRIINFOTECH

Sr. No.	Description	Decision of ETEC committee
1	Team leader cum Senior Highway Engineer	ETEC committee has reviewed the CV of Team Leader and committee observed the following: (i) As per Infracon CV, Projects at Sr. No. 1 to 12 are 2 lane projects developed by Ministry of Defence. However these roads are still of single lane standard, hence, same not considered by ETEC. (ii) As per Infracon CV, Team Leader had worked at Ministry of Defence during the duration of 1997 to 2006. However detailed work details mentioned at Projects Sr. No. 13 to 16 are overlapping stretch, hence,

		<p>same not considered by ETEC.</p> <p>(iii) As per Infracon CV, projects at Sr. no 18&amp; 19 have same duration for DPR as well as Construction supervision, projects at Sr. no 25&amp; 26 have same duration for O&amp;M as well as Construction supervision and projects at Sr. no 27&amp; 28 have same duration for O&amp;M as well as Construction supervision. Hence projects not considered by ETEC. Accordingly marks are allotted and team leader has scored 70 marks which is less than 75 marks. The detailed evaluation attached at Annexure-1.</p>
2	Other key Personnel. i. Resident cum Highway Engineer, ii. Senior Quality cum Material Expert & iii. Bridge/Structural Engineer	Team Leader score less than 75 marks as per clause 3.4. x (f) of Section-2 of RFP, the firm considered as non-responsive, hence ETEC committee has not reviewed the cvs of other key personnel i.e. i. Resident cum Highway Engineer, ii. Senior Quality cum Material Expert & iii. Bridge/Structural Engineer.

**b) M/s Planning & Infrastructural Development Consultants Pvt Ltd in association with M/s Agnitio infrastructure Projects Pvt Ltd - M/s G Eng. Advisory Services Private Limited (JV)**

Sr. No.	Description	Decision of ETEC committee
1	Team leader cum Senior Highway Engineer	<p>ETEC committee has reviewed the CV of Team Leader and committee observed the following:</p> <p>(i) As per Infracon CV, projects at Sr. no 8&amp; 9 have same duration for O&amp;M as well as Construction supervision. Further work for 2 laning from km 0 to 20 &amp; 2 lane from km 52 to 56 of NH-38 was constructed by MoRTH in Nov 2008. Hence same not considered by ETEC.</p> <p>(ii) As per Infracon CV, projects at Sr. no 10&amp; 11 have same duration. Further, he has worked as Team Leader in two projects i.e. in Nagaland &amp; Gujarat. Hence same not considered by ETEC.</p> <p>Accordingly marks are allotted and team leader scored 62 marks which is less than 75 marks. The detailed evaluation attached at Annexure-1.</p>
2	Other key Personnel. i. Resident cum Highway Engineer, ii. Senior Quality cum Material Expert & iii. Bridge/Structural Engineer	Team Leader score less than 75 marks as per clause 3.4. x (f) of Section-2 of RFP, the firm considered as non-responsive, hence ETEC committee has not reviewed the CVs of other key personnel i.e. i. Resident cum Highway Engineer, ii. Senior Quality cum Material Expert & iii. Bridge/Structural Engineer.

**c) M/s Almondz Global Infra Consultant Ltd- M/s Manglam Associates (JV)**


Sr. No.	Description	Decision of ETEC committee
1	Resident cum Highway Engineer	<p>ETEC committee has reviewed the CV of Resident cum Highway Engineer and committee observed the following:</p> <p>As per Infracon CV, Resident cum Highway Engineer had mentioned at projects Sr. no 6&amp; 7 have same duration and he worked in two projects. Hence same not considered by ETEC.</p> <p>Accordingly marks are allotted. The detailed evaluation attached at Annexure-1.</p>

2	Senior Quality cum Material Expert	ETEC committee has reviewed the CV of Senior Quality cum Material Expert and committee observed the following: As per Infracon CV, Senior Quality cum Material Expert had mentioned at projects Sr. no 2 & 3 have same duration and he worked in two projects. Hence same not considered by ETEC.  Accordingly marks are allotted. The detailed evaluation attached at Annexure-1.
3	Team leader cum Senior Highway Engineer and Bridge/Structural Engineer	There is no change in marks.

5. Considering the Para 4 above, the revised evaluation result of eligible bidders is as under:

Sr. No	Name of Bidder	Technical Score	Status
1	M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s SRIINFOTECH	Non Responsive as Team Leader score less than 75 marks as per clause 3.4. x (f) of Section-2 of RFP.	Non - Eligible
2	M/s Planning & Infrastructural Development Consultants Pvt Ltd in association with M/s Agnitio infrastructure Projects Pvt Ltd – M/s G Eng. Advisory Services Private Limited (JV)	Non Responsive as Team Leader score less than 75 marks as per clause 3.4. x (f) of Section-2 of RFP.	Non - Eligible
3	M/s Almondz Global Infra Consultant Ltd- M/s Manglam Associates (JV)	84.63	Eligible

6. In view of the above, ETEC observed that only one bid is eligible leading to single bid, hence, ETEC committee recommended to re-bid the subject work after the approval of Competent Authority.

  
W. Blah  
ED-V  
Convener

  
Rajeev Sood  
GM-Tech  
Member Secretary

  
A. K. Singh  
GM-Tech  
Member

  
A.K. Jha  
DGM(Tech)  
Presenting Officer

*on leave*  
Uttam Chatterjee  
DGM-Fin.  
Member

Consultancy Services for Authority's Engineer for Supervision of "Construction of (i) 2 laning of existing Hunli-Anini road on EPC basis from design km 21.50 to km 37.50 (ii) 2 laning of existing Hunli-Anini road on EPC basis from design km 37.50 to km 53.50 and (iii) 2 laning of existing Hunli-Anini road on EPC basis from design km 53.50 to km 92.500 in the state of Arunachal Pradesh			
Total Assigned Score of the Firm			
S. No.	Details	Total Marks	Almondz Global Infra Consultant Ltd- Manglam Associates (JV)
1	Marks for Relevant Experience for the Assignment of the firm	40	35.00
2	Marks for experience in use of technology for road inspection	20	14.00
3	<b>Total marks for Firms Experience</b>	60	49.00
4	Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer	15	13.65
5	Resident Cum Highway Engineer	10	8.70
6	Bridge/ Structural Engineer	7.5	6.83
7	Senior Quality cum Material Expert	7.5	6.45
8	<b>Total for Key Personnel</b>	40	36
	<b>Grand Total (3+8)</b>	100	84.63

Consultancy Services for Authority's Engineer for Supervision of "Construction of (i) 2 laning of existing Hunli-Anini road on EPC basis from design km 21.50 to km 37.50 (ii) 2 laning of existing Hunli-Anini road on EPC basis from design km 37.50 to km 53.50 and (iii) 2 laning of existing Hunli-Anini road on EPC basis from design km 53.50 to km 92.500 in the state of Arunachal Pradesh under SARDP-NE."

Evaluation Criteria for Assessment of Key Staff for the Assignment

Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer

S.No.	Description	Maximum Marks	Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with SRIINFOTECH	Planning & Infrastructural Development Consultants Pvt. Ltd in association with Agnitio Infrastructure Projects Pvt. Ltd - G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited (JV)
			Vinay Ashish John Singh	Kawal Bas Singh
<b>1</b>	<b>General Qualification : 25 Marks</b>			
(i)	Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21
(ii)	Post-Graduation in Management / Construction / Transportation/Highway Engineering/Structural Engineering or equivalent specialised stream of civil engineering	4	0	4
<b>2</b>	<b>Adequacy for the project : 70 Marks</b>			
(a)	Professional Experience in Highway projects :			
(i)	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway projects < 12 years - 0 marks 12 years - 8 marks Add 1 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 2 (two) marks.	10	0.000	0
(ii)	Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity in Highway Development projects (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning** and above) < 5 years -0 5 years -11 Add 1 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.	15	13	14
(iii)	Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity in Highway Development projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above) on EPC.  1 Projects - 4 marks  Add 1 marks extra for additional projects subject to maximum 1 (one) marks.	5	5	5
(b)	Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity of Project preparation including design of major highway Project (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above).  < 2 project - 0 marks 2 projects - 11 marks Add 2 marks for each additional project subject to maximum 4 marks.	15	13	0
(c)	Experience in position of Team Leader/Project Manager or similar capacity in Construction Supervision/IC involving length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above < 2 Projects - 0 marks 2 Projects -16 marks Add 2 marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.	20	18	18
(d)	Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity in Operation & Maintenance of Major Highway (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above). 1 project - 4 marks Add 1 mark extra for each additional project subject to maximum 1 mark.	5	0	0
3	Employment with the firm < 1 year - 0 1 year - 3 marks Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 mark	5	0	0
	<b>Total marks</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>70.00</b>	<b>62.00</b>

*[Handwritten signatures and initials in blue ink]*

**Consultancy Services for Authority's Engineer for Supervision of "Construction of (i) 2 laning of existing Hunli-Anini road on EPC basis from design km 21.50 to km 37.50 (ii) 2 laning of existing Hunli-Anini road on EPC basis from design km 37.50 to km 53.50 and (iii) 2 laning of existing Hunli-Anini road on EPC basis from design km 53.50 to km 70.00"**

**Evaluation Criteria for Assessment of Key Staff for the Assignment**

**Resident Cum Highway Engineer**

S.No.	Description	Maximum Marks	Almondz Global Infra Consultant Ltd- Manglam Associates (JV)
			Feroz Hashmi
1	<b>General Qualification : 25 marks</b>		
(i)	Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21
(ii)	Post Graduation in Transportation/Pavement Engineering	4	0
2	<b>Adequacy for the Project : 70 marks</b> <b>Professional Experience</b>		
(i)	Total Professional Experience in Handling Highway projects < 12 years - 0 marks 12 years - 16 marks Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.	20	19 15 years (1 to 5)
(ii)	Experience as Resident Engineer/Project Director /Project Manager /Superintending Engineer or equivalent /Executive Engineer or equivalent on similar construction works/Authority Engineer/ Independent Engineering Projects (similar configuration (2/4/6-laning*) and above). < 5 years - 0 marks 5 years - 15 marks Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 5 (five) marks.	20	20 15 years (1 to 5)
(iii)	Experience in similar capacity in handling major 2/4/6 laning ** projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above). < 2 no.s - 0 marks 2 no.s - 19 marks Add 3 (Three) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 6 (Six) marks.	25	22 (1,2,5)
(iv)	Experience in similar capacity of Highway Project of Construction/Construction Supervision/IC on EPC mode (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above). 1 project - 4 marks Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional project subject to Maximam 1 (one) mark.	5	5 (1,2,5)
3	Employment with the Firm < 1 year - 0 1 year - 3 Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks	5	0
	<b>Total marks</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>87</b>

*(Handwritten signatures and initials)*

**Consultancy Services for Authority's Engineer for Supervision of "Construction of (i) 2 laning of existing Hunli-Ani road on EPC basis from design km 21.50 to km 37.50 (ii) 2 laning of existing Hunli-Anini road on EPC basis from design km 37.50 to km 53.50 and (iii) 2 laning of existing Hunli-Anini road on EPC basis from design km 53.50 to km 92.500 in the state of Arunachal Pradesh under SARDP-NE "**

**Evaluation Criteria for Assessment of Key Staff for the Assignment**

**Senior Quality cum Material Expert**

S.No.	Description	Maximum Marks	Almondz Global Infra Consultant Ltd- Manglar Associates (JV)
			Naween Arya
<b>1</b>	<b>General Qualification : 25 marks</b>		
(i)	Graduate in Civil Engineering	<b>21</b>	21
(ii)	Post Graduation in Geo-Technical Engineering/Foundation Engineering/Soil Mechanics/Rock Mechanics	<b>4</b>	0
<b>2</b>	<b>Adequacy for the Project : 70 marks</b> <b>Professional Experienc</b>		
i)	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway/Bridge Projects < 10 years - 0 marks 10 years - 11 marks Add one mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.	<b>15</b>	15  15 years (1,4,5,7,9)
ii)	Experience in similar capacity in Construction / Construction Supervision of major Highway projects (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above). < 5 years - 0 marks 5 years - 19 marks Add 2 (two) marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 6 (Six) marks.	<b>25</b>	25  8 years (4,5,7,9)
iii)	Experience in similar capacity in handling similar Highway projects(of length 40% of project leghth or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 Laneing**) and above < 2 nos - 0 marks 2 nos - 25 marks Add 2.5 marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 5 (five) marks.	<b>30</b>	25  2 no (4,7)
<b>3</b>	Employment with the firm < 1 year - 0 marks 1 year - 3 marks Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks	<b>5</b>	0  nil
	<b>Total marks</b>	<b>100</b>	86.00

